IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS SUMMIT COUNTY, OHIO

MEMBER WILLIAMS, et al.,

Case No. 2016-CV-09-3928

Plaintiffs,

Judge James A. Brogan

vs.

KISLING, NESTICO & REDICK, LLC, et al.,

Plaintiffs' Motion for Leave to File under Seal the Deposition Transcripts of Defendant Sam Ghoubrial, M.D., and Richard Gunning, M.D.

Defendants.

Under the September 12, 2017 protective order, Plaintiffs hereby seek leave to file under seal the deposition transcripts of Defendant Sam Ghoubrial, M.D., and Richard Gunning, M.D. *See* protective order, Section 8.d, p. 9 ("a party seeking to file a brief, pleading, or exhibit under seal shall first file a motion for leave to file under seal prior to filing such brief, pleading, or exhibit"); and Section 8.c, p. 8 ("To the extent that it is necessary for a party to discuss the contents of any confidential information ... in a written pleading, then such portion ... may be filed under seal with leave of court.").

As before, Plaintiffs have no choice but to manually file these "documents under seal," due to the Defendants' designating the entirety of the transcripts as "confidential." *Id.* at Section 8, p. 7-8 ("[T]o the extent that a brief, memorandum, or pleading references any document marked as" confidential, then the pleading "shall refer the Court to the particular exhibit filed under seal without disclosing the contents of any confidential information."). Upon receiving confidentiality designations from Defendants, Plaintiffs will promptly file a copy of each transcript reflecting the portions the Defendants believe to be "confidential" under the protective order.

Because the Defendants have insisted that the entirety of Defendant Ghoubrial's and Dr. Gunning's deposition transcripts are "confidential" under the protective order, good cause exists to grant Plaintiffs leave to file them under seal.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Rachel Hazelet

Peter Pattakos (0082884) Rachel Hazelet (0097855) THE PATTAKOS LAW FIRM LLC 101 Ghent Road Fairlawn, Ohio 44333

Phone: 330.836.8533 Fax: 330.836.8536 peter@pattakoslaw.com rhazelet@pattakoslaw.com

Joshua R. Cohen (0032368) Ellen Kramer (0055552) COHEN ROSENTHAL & KRAMER LLP The Hoyt Block Building, Suite 400 Cleveland, Ohio 44113 Phone: 216.781.7956 Fax: 216.781.8061

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

jcohen@crklaw.com

Certificate of Service

The foregoing document was filed on April 19, 2019, using the Court's electronic-filing system, which will serve copies on all necessary parties. Personal counsel for Richard Gunning, M.D., John Myers, Esq. (johnmyerscolpa@gmail.com), was also emailed a copy of this document on this date.

<u>/s/ Rachel Hazelet</u>
Attorney for Plaintiffs